

CHAMPLAIN VALLEY EDUCATIONAL SERVICES  
Board of Cooperative Educational Services  
Sole Supervisory District of Clinton, Essex,  
Warren and Washington Counties

DATE: December 14, 2022  
KIND OF MEETING: Regular Board Meeting  
PLACE: CVES Conference Center – Plattsburgh, NY

Board Members Present:

Leisa Boise  
Kathy Comins-Hunter  
Patricia Gero  
Richard Harriman, Sr.  
Donna LaRocque  
Ed Marin  
Thomas McCabe  
Bruce Murdock  
Emily Phillips  
Lori Saunders  
Florence Sears  
Michael St. Pierre  
Donna Wotton

Board Members Absent:

William Malott  
  
Executive Officer:  
Dr. Mark C. Davey  
  
Board Clerk:  
Meaghan Rabideau

Others Present:

Amy Campbell  
Eric Bell  
Michele Friedman  
Matthew Slattery  
Adam Facteau  
Brett French  
Meghan Zedick

MEETING  
TO ORDER

Board President St. Pierre called the meeting to order at 8:04 p.m.

EXECUTIVE  
SESSION

Mr. Murdock moved, seconded by Mrs. Boise, that the Board go into Executive Session at 8:05 p.m., for the following reasons: #4 - A matter of discussion regarding proposed, pending or current litigation; #5 - A matter of collective negotiations pursuant to article 14 of Civil Service Law (the Taylor Law); #6 - A matter of the medical, financial, credit or employment history of a particular person or corporation, or matters leading to the appointment, employment, promotion, demotion, discipline, suspension, dismissal or removal of a particular person or corporation; #9 - A matter related to a specific student of the district. All Board Members present voted yes—motion carried.

In Executive Session, the Board began by holding a Stage III Grievance Hearing with the CVES Administrators' Unit. In attendance for CVES, including District Superintendent Dr. Mark Davey, was Ms. Meghan Zedick, Esq. from Stafford, Owens, Murnane, Kelleher, Meyer & Zedick, PLLC., and Mr. Eric Bell, and Mrs. Amy Campbell. In attendance for the Administrative Unit were Mr. Adam Facteau, Association President, and SAANYS (School Administrators Association of NYS (New York State), legal representation Brett French. Second, a litigation update was shared regarding a recent lawsuit received regarding a student disciplinary incident from the 2021-22 school year. Third, several labor relations matters were reviewed, including a Memorandum of Agreement (MOA) with the 10-Month Support Unit (CSEA) recommended for action at the meeting and several other position proposals under consideration. Next, an update was provided on an investigation involving the HSE (High School Equivalency)/GED testing matter and misadministration, including confidential follow-up recommendations. Fifth, Dr. Davey provided an update on confidential staff matters, including hiring

recommendations, personnel matters, and anticipated retirements. Lastly, the Board was updated on several upcoming labor relations topics involving staff members.

Mr. Murdock moved, seconded by Mr. McCabe, that the Board come out of Executive Session at 9:06 p.m. All Board Members present voted yes—motion carried.

MOMENT OF  
SILENCE

The Board recognized the work and accomplishments of former CVES Board member, Arlene Penfield, who recently passed away. The Board and members of the audience then shared a moment of silence in her memory. Sentiments were expressed by the Board, along with examples of her many contributions to the community.

AUDIT  
COMMITTEE  
UPDATE

Dr. Davey thanked the Board's Audit Committee members for their attendance and participation in the earlier meeting this evening. Mr. Bell then reviewed the Corrective Action Plan from year end June 30, 2022, which the Committee recommended for approval. Next, the Internal Auditor recommendation of Management Advisory Group of N.Y., Inc. was shared. The Internal Auditor will provide all annual audit services of BOCES funds for the 2022-23, 2023-24, and 2024-25 school years (based on annual appointment by the CVES Board). The next Audit Committee meeting will be held on February 8, 2023.

BUDGET  
COMMITTEE  
UPDATE

Dr. Davey began the update by thanking the Budget Committee members for their time and service on the Committee. He acknowledged the work of our CVES Assistant Superintendents, Directors, CVES Treasurer, and accountants, who helped review and complete the comprehensive budget updates. Next, Mr. Bell presented a brief overview of the budget reconciliations of each division, growth across CVES with increased participation in CoSers, and he shared information on the planned full Foundation Aid of school districts by the Legislature. Board Members Leisa Boise, Lori Saunders, and Patricia Gero serve on the Committee and commended the entire team for the exceptional job. They also noted that it is apparent that the education of our CVES students is the number one priority, and they appreciate the continuing work to develop the best budgets possible. The next Budget Committee meeting will be held on January 25, 2023, at 6:00 p.m. at the CVES Conference Center.

DS UPDATE

Dr. Davey shared that several CVES holiday events have occurred including the CV-TEC participation in the Annual Plattsburgh City Holiday Parade and the St. Nicholas Fire Truck that visited the students of the Rise Center for Success. He thanked the team for their engagement in making this time of year special for our students. Dr. Davey next noted the press release for Mrs. Maria Huntington, CVES' new Supervisor of Adult Services & Programming at One Work Source. Third, Dr. Davey shared updates from the November 28-29<sup>th</sup> DS meetings he attended. There are two local districts that could be impacted by this memo. Specific references from the memo were reviewed with the Board, and discussion

then ensued. Additional items including DS DEI professional development planning for sustainable change, 2023-24 SED tentative exam dates, and the NYSED revised organization chart, were shared. Fourth, the recent Rural Schools Association (RSA) Winter Conference - The Gathering – held in Saratoga, NY, was attended by Dr. Davey and Board members Mr. Richard Harriman Sr., and Mrs. Leisa Boise. Mr. Harriman shared that he was able to talk with Commissioner Rosa about the topic of potential issues of electric busses in rural areas. Mrs. Boise shared highlights of conference presentations, including promoting education excellence and how to make things better for students with civil readiness and civil knowledge. Lastly, the upcoming Clinton & Essex County School Boards Meeting - *School Financial Education for School Boards* with Dr. Rick Timbs – will be held on February 2, 2023.

CORRECTIVE  
ACTION PLAN &  
AUDIT RESPONSE

Mrs. LaRocque moved, seconded by Mrs. Hunter that the Board approve the Corrective Action Plan for the 2021-22 Annual Independent Audit Management Letter Comments. All Board Members present voted yes—motion carried.

PREVIOUS  
MINUTES

Mr. Murdock moved, seconded by Mrs. Boise, to approve the minutes of the November 9, 2022 Board Meeting as presented. All Board Members present voted yes—motion carried.

CONSENT  
AGENDA  
FINANCIAL

Mr. Harriman Sr. moved, seconded by Mrs. Boise, to approve the following Consent Agenda Financial items as presented. All Board Members present voted yes—motion carried.

CERTIFICATION  
OF WARRANT

Approve the Certification of Warrant for November 1, 2022 to December 1, 2022, as presented.

TREASURER’S  
REPORTS

Approve the Treasurer’s Report from October 31, 2022 as presented.

DONATIONS

Approve the following Donations:

1. Donation of a Walmart gift card from Meaghan McKenna, valued at \$50. This donation will be used to purchase snow sleds for students at the Rise Center for Success.
2. Donation of a stove and washing machine from Frank Mercier, with an estimated value of \$1,000. This donation will benefit the Pre-CTE Food Service Program.

BUDGET  
INCREASES

Approve the following Budget Increases:

1. School Curriculum Improvement Service budget from \$819,697 to \$956,560, for the 2022-2023 school year, to accommodate for additional district requests. (Co-Ser 506 - S3)

2. Inter-Scholastic Sports Coordination budget from \$425,673 to \$877,400, for the 2022-2023 school year, to accommodate for the costs of payments to officials. (Co-Ser 554 - S3)
3. Instructional Technology Service budget from \$1,090,152 to \$1,424,620, for the 2022-2023 school year, to accommodate for additional district participation. (AuSable, Moriah, Northern Adirondack) (Co-Ser 564 – S3)
4. School Public Relations budget from \$162,766 to \$185,090, for the 2022-2023 school year, to accommodate for the cost restructuring of the service. (Co-Ser 610 – S3)
5. Emergency Communications System budget from \$74,698 to \$77,915, for the 2022-2023 school year to accommodate for additional district participation. (Brushton-Moira) (Co-Ser 640 – S3)
6. Substitute Coordination budget from \$17,849 to \$32,622, for the 2022-2023 school year to accommodate for additional district participation. (AuSable) (Co-Ser 654 – S3)
7. Career and Technical Education – Job Target/Pre-CTE Program budget from \$731,209 to \$835,941 due to increased participation in Job Target/Pre-CTE classes for the 2022-2023 school year. (CoSer 115/116 – CV-TEC)

**CONTRACTOR/  
CONSULTANT  
AGREEMENT**

Approve the following Contractor/Consultant Agreement:

1. Clinton-Essex-Warren-Washington BOCES and Jen Hesselstine Education Consulting for the purpose of obtaining a “New Teacher Workshop Series” for BOCES and participating Districts. The workshops will take place at the CVES Conference Center in Plattsburgh on the dates of February 8, 2023 and March 14, 2023. The total amount for services is \$5,000. (S3)

**PREVENTATIVE  
MAINTENANCE  
CONTRACT**

Approve the following Preventative Maintenance Contract:

1. Contract between Clinton-Essex-Warren-Washington BOCES and Otis Elevator Company for the purpose of obtaining a preventive maintenance service plan for the Otis Elevator located at the Plattsburgh Satellite Campus. The contract duration shall be for a period of five years beginning January 3, 2023 and ending January 2, 2028 and may renew for successive five-year terms upon notice to Otis Elevator of BOCES intent to proceed. Commencing with the initial contract term of January 3, 2023 through January 2, 2024 the annual maintenance fee shall be \$2,712, with fees adjusting annually or in response to labor rate increases and/or substantial changes in service-related expenses. (Management Services)

AGREEMENTS  
FOR SERVICE

Approve the following Agreements for Service:

1. Clinton-Essex-Warren-Washington BOCES and Leadership for Educational Achievement Foundation, Inc. (LEAF) under which LEAF will provide leadership coaching services for specified district positions at Peru Central School District during the 2022-23 school year. The total amount for all services will be \$5,500. (S3)
2. Clinton-Essex-Warren-Washington BOCES and Leadership for Educational Achievement Foundation, Inc. (LEAF) under which LEAF will provide leadership coaching services for specified district positions at Boquet Valley Central School District during the 2022-23 school year. The total amount for all services will be \$6,600. (S3)
3. Clinton-Essex-Warren-Washington BOCES and Leadership for Educational Achievement Foundation, Inc. (LEAF) under which LEAF will provide leadership coaching services for specified district positions at Chazy Central School District during the 2022-23 school year. The total amount for all services will be \$6,600. (S3)

MEMORANDUM  
OF AGREEMENT

Approve the following Memorandum of Agreement:

1. Agreement between Clinton-Essex-Warren-Washington (CEWW) BOCES and Franklin-Essex-Hamilton (FEH) BOCES under which CEWW BOCES will reimburse FEH BOCES for professional services rendered in connection with the Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program Employment & Training Venture V Program (SNAP ET Venture V) in an amount not to exceed \$80,000 annually. The period of the agreement is December 1, 2021 through November 30, 2026. (CV-TEC)

INTERNAL  
AUDITOR  
APPOINTMENT/  
ENGAGEMENT  
LETTER

Appoint Management Advisory Group of N.Y., Inc. of Catskill, NY as the Clinton-Essex-Warran-Washington BOCES Internal Auditor for the 2022-2023 internal audits and approve the engagement letter. The fee for the 2022-2023 audit is not to exceed \$8,000.

INTERNAL AUDIT  
SERVICES

Approve Management Advisory Group of N.Y., Inc. of Catskill, NY for Internal Audit Services for the annual audit of all funds of the BOCES, for the 2022-23, 2023-24, and 2024-25 school years. The fees are contingent upon the Board's annual appointment of Management Advisory Group of N.Y., Inc. as internal auditor and are not to exceed the following:

2022-2023	\$8,000
2023-2024	\$8,500
2024-2025	\$9,000

Page 6  
Board Minutes  
December 14, 2022

CONSENT  
AGENDA  
PERSONNEL

Mr. Murdock moved, seconded by Mr. Harriman Sr., to approve the following Consent Agenda Personnel items as presented. All Board Members present voted yes—motion carried.

AMEND

1. Amend the following Four-Year Probationary Appointment(s) that was approved at the July 13, 2023 Board: Susan Tourville, Teaching Assistant, Tenure Area: Teaching Assistant, Effective Date: August 31, 2022, Annual Base Salary: ~~\$26,314~~ **\$33,000**

2. Amend the following Four-Year Probationary Appointment(s) that was approved at the October 12, 2023 Board meeting: Helen Jessey, Allied Health Teacher, Tenure Area: ~~School Nurse Teacher~~ **Practical Nurse Instructor**

RESIGNATIONS  
FOR THE PURPOSE  
OF RETIREMENT  
RYAN, DAYTON,  
LADUE,  
THWAITTS,  
TEDFORD

Accept the following letter(s) of Resignation for the Purpose of Retirement:

1. Sandra Ryan, Physical Therapist, effective June 24, 2023
2. Faye Dayton, Special Education Teacher, effective June 30, 2023
3. Amy LaDue, Teaching Assistant, effective June 30, 2023
4. Beverly Thwaitts, Cosmetology Teacher, effective June 30, 2023
5. Dena Tedford, Health Careers Program Coordinator, effective June 30, 2023

RESIGNATIONS  
SNIDE, CUTTING,  
BOLLING,  
WANMER,  
LEFEVRE,  
DOUGLASS, RYAN

Accept the following letter(s) of Resignation:

1. Brandy Snide, Teacher Aide/Student Aide, effective November 23, 2022
2. Jamie Cutting, Teacher Aide/Student Aide, effective December 2, 2022
3. Destiny Bolling, Teacher Aide Student Aide, effective December 10, 2022
4. Leslie Wanmer, Teacher Aide/Student Aide, effective December 15, 2022
5. Christina LeFevre, Account Clerk/Typist, effective December 17, 2022
6. Robin Douglass, Special Education Teacher, effective December 22, 2022
7. Shawn Ryan, Security and Law Enforcement Teacher, effective June 30, 2023

LEAVE OF  
ABSENCE PATEL

Approve the following leave(s) of absence:

1. Chirag Patel, Account Clerk/Typist, unpaid leave of absence, effective March 1, 2023 - March 31, 2023

FOUR-YEAR  
PROBATIONARY  
APPOINTMENTS  
KOTSOGIANNIS,  
ROMEO, MISIK,  
GARRISON

Appoint the following person(s) to a Four-Year Probationary Appointment as follows:

1. Kathleen Kotsogiannis, Teaching Assistant, Effective October 6, 2021
2. Maryssa Romeo, Teaching Assistant (was temporary), Effective October 20, 2022
3. Deborah Misik, Food Service Teacher (was temporary), Effective October 21, 2022

4. Erin Lee Garrison, Teaching Assistant, Effective January 3, 2023, Annualized Salary of \$33,000, Prorated Salary of \$19,800

(The Expiration date for the above appointments are tentative and conditional only. Except to the extent required by the applicable provisions of Section 3012 of the Education Law, in order to be granted tenure the teacher must receive composite or overall annual professional performance review ratings pursuant to Section 3012-c and/or 3012d of the Education Law of either effective or highly effective in at least three (3) of the four (4) preceding years, and if the teacher receives an ineffective composite or overall rating in the final year of the probationary period the teacher shall not be eligible for tenure at that time).

CIVIL SERVICE  
PROBATIONARY  
APPOINTMENTS  
PEETS, ARTHUR,  
BRAWN,  
NORWOOD

Appoint the following person(s) to a 52-week Civil Service Probationary Appointment as follows:

1. Kurt L. Peets, Custodial Worker, Effective November 21, 2022, Annualized Salary of \$32,876, Prorated Salary of \$20,231.38

2. Joshua Arthur, Custodial Worker, Effective November 28, 2022, Annualized Salary of \$32,876, Pro-rated Salary of \$19,599.15

3. Heather Brawn, Account Clerk/Typist, Effective November 28, 2022, Annualized Salary of \$28,291, Prorated Salary of \$16,865.79

4. Emily Norwood, Teacher Aide/Student Aide, Effective November 29, 2022, Annualized Salary of \$19,226, Prorated Salary of \$13,525.83

CIVIL SERVICE  
PROVISIONAL  
APPOINTMENT  
SANTANIELLO

Appoint the following person(s) to a Civil Service Provisional appointment as follows:

1. Theodore Santaniello, Network and Systems Technician, Effective December 15, 2023, Annualized Salary of \$60,894, Prorated Salary of \$ 33,023.28

(EFFECTIVE PERMANENT DATE TO BE DETERMINED UPON SUCCESSFUL COMPLETION OF CIVIL SERVICE

PERMANENT  
APPOINTMENTS  
LOTTIE, GORDON,  
TAYLOR

Grant a Permanent Appointment (Civil Service) to the following person(s):

1. Shelbie Lottie, Lifeguard, Effective October 1, 2022

2. Margaret Gordon, Teacher Aide/Student Aide, Effective December 21, 2022

3. Haley Taylor, Network and Systems Technician, Effective January 11, 2023

PART-TIME  
APPOINTMENT  
LOZIER

Approve the following Part-time position from November 29, 2022 - June 30, 2023:

1. Randy Lozier, Office Manager (COVID-19 Testing Coordinator), \$48/hour

Page 8  
Board Minutes  
December 14, 2022

TEMPORARY  
APPOINTMENTS  
NORTON

Appoint the following person(s) to a Temporary Appointment for the 2022-23 school year:

1. Staci Norton, Teaching Assistant (uncertified), Effective August 31, 2022 - June 30, 2023, Annualized Salary of \$28,314

TEMPORARY  
GRANT  
APPOINTMENT

Appoint the following person(s) to a Temporary Grant Appointment from January 1, 2023 - June 30, 2023:

1. Andrew Mitchell, Work Study Student, not to exceed 160 hours, at \$14.20/hour

ADDITIONAL  
WORK

Approve the following Additional Work for the 2022-23 School Year:

Stipend Positions, Compensation per collective bargaining agreement

Brandy Rosselli	Yearbook Advisor, Mineville Campus
Joan Hubbard	New Employee Mentor

Shared Decision Making, Hourly rate of pay per contract

Lisa Briscoe	not to exceed 20 hours
Dawn Abar	not to exceed 20 hours

FACILITATOR(S)

Approve the following Facilitator(s) for the 2022-23 School Year:

Facilitators, \$30.00/hour

Rebecca Banker

SUBSTITUTES

Approve the following list of Substitute and Temporary-On-Call appointments for the 2022-23 school year:

<u>Name</u>	<u>Title</u>
Stephanie Lumb	Bus Driver
Destiny Bolling	Teacher Aide/Student Aide

MEMORANDUM  
OF AGREEMENT  
WITH CEWW  
BOCES CSEA UNIT

Mr. Murdock moved, seconded by Mr. Harriman, Sr., that the Board approve the Memorandum of Agreement between Clinton-Essex-Warren-Washington Board of Cooperative Educational Services and the CVES CSEA Unit that provides pay increases for current staff and amends the starting salaries chart due to minimum wage increase effective December 31, 2022. All Board Members present voted yes—motion carried.

REVISED  
POLICIES  
1<sup>ST</sup> READING

The following revised policies were presented for a first reading:

#3230 Organizational Chart



- ADMINISTRATIVE LEAVE Mr. Murdock moved, seconded by Mrs. Boise, that upon the recommendation of the District Superintendent, the Clinton-Essex-Warren-Washington Board of Cooperative Educational Services hereby continues the administrative leave of a temporary employee through January 11, 2023. All Board Members present voted yes—motion carried.
- RESIGNATION(S) MANNING Mr. Murdock moved, seconded by Mrs. Boise, that the Board accept the following letter(s) of Resignation:
1. Karen Manning, Adult Literacy Teacher, effective January 12, 2023  
All Board Members present voted yes—motion carried.
- STRATEGIC PLAN UPDATE Dr. Davey noted the District Planning Team meeting held on December 13<sup>th</sup> where the team reviewed divisional progress to date and began planning for upcoming Board presentations. Strategic Planning 2023-24 school year meeting dates were shared with the Board for their consideration, as well as dates for a Board Retreat for further work with Dr. Stephen Danna. The Board was in favor of all dates, and decided on Monday, October 23, 2023 for next year's Board Retreat.
- OTHER The Board and Dr. Davey recognized all retirees on the Board agenda this evening. They were acknowledged for their dedication and many years of service to CVES, the students, and the community. Division Directors also shared sentiments and well wishes.
- NEXT BOARD MEETING The next Board meeting will be held on Wednesday, January 11, 2023, at the Yandon-Dillon Center in Mineville. An anticipated Executive Session will begin at 6:00 p.m., with the monthly meeting to follow.
- ADJOURNMENT Mr. Murdock moved, seconded by Mr. Harriman Sr. to adjourn the meeting at 9:47 p.m. All Board Members present voted yes—motion carried.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Meaghan Rabideau, Board Clerk